



April 4, 2011

Ms. Kathy Cooper, Water/WRP Superintendent  
Rochelle Municipal Utilities  
P.O. Box 456  
Rochelle, Illinois 61068

Re: Kelley Drive Watermain Replacement  
WHA No. 1272D10  
Bid Summary

Dear Kathy:

Proposals for the Kelley Drive Watermain Replacement project were received and opened on March 31, 2011 at 11:00 A.M. at the Rochelle City Council chambers. Eleven (11) proposals were received.

One (1) addendum was issued prior to the bid opening. All proposals were submitted with the required bid security. The proposals were reviewed for completeness and read aloud. A tabulation of all the bids, including a listing of items to be submitted with the proposal, was later verified. A certified copy of the bid tabulation is attached for your information.

#### **BIDDING IRREGULARITIES**

Hart & Sons LLC didn't sign and attest the Bid Bond form, and the Statement of Bidder's Qualifications form was not dated and the Notary Public didn't complete all the information. Also Hart & Sons LLC had a mathematical error on their Proposal for the Curb and Gutter Replacement bid item that increased their bid amount by \$0.40.

O'Brien Civil Works Inc. made a mathematical error in totaling their bid. Their corrected total bid amount was decreased by \$0.05 to \$217,771.15.

#### **SUMMARY OF BIDS**

The low bid of \$148,118.69 was \$74,405.31 and 33.4% under our estimate of \$222,524.00. A tabulation of the bids comparing them to our estimate in dollars and percentages is as follows:

CONTRACTOR	BID	\$ Over/Under Estimate	\$ Over/Under Estimate
Hart & Sons LLC Rochelle, Illinois	\$148,118.69	\$74,405.31 ↓	33.4% ↓
Go Excavating, Inc. Freeport, Illinois	\$164,235.00	\$58,289.00 ↓	26.2% ↓
Stark & Son Trenching Inc. Hampshire, Illinois	\$169,067.00	\$53,457.00 ↓	24.0% ↓
Martin & Company Excavating Oregon, Illinois	\$187,849.20	\$34,674.80 ↓	15.6% ↓
Stenstrom Excavation and Blacktop Group Rockford, Illinois	\$194,724.00	\$27,800.00 ↓	12.5% ↓
Northern Illinois Service Company Rockford, Illinois	\$194,950.80	\$27,573.20 ↓	12.4% ↓
Fischer Excavating, Inc. Freeport, Illinois	\$199,261.39	\$23,262.61 ↓	10.5% ↓
O'Brien Civil Works Inc. Polo, Illinois	\$217,771.15	\$ 4,752.85 ↓	2.1% ↓
William Charles Construction Company, LLC Loves Park, Illinois	\$223,385.85	\$ 861.85 ↑	0.4% ↑
Kelsey Excavating, Inc. Davis, Illinois	\$239,846.00	\$17,322.00 ↑	7.8% ↑
Civil Constructors, Inc. Freeport, Illinois	\$256,160.79	\$33,636.79 ↑	15.1% ↑

#### STATEMENT OF BIDDER'S QUALIFICATIONS

We have no previous working experience with Hart & Sons LLC on any type of projects. Based on information provided on the Statement of Bidder's Qualifications form and the attached letter and reference list, we can report the following.

1. Hart & Sons LLC was incorporated in 2009. The owners are Mr. Tom Hart and Mr. Matt Hart. Previously Mr. Tom Hart did business under Hart Excavating, Inc. Mr. Tom Hart has 25 years of experience in excavation and construction fields and Mr. Matt Hart has five (5) years of experience.
2. Hart & Sons LLC described the general character of their work as excavation contracts including, but not limited to, commercial, residential and agricultural excavation, drainage, demolition, site preparation and various other activities associated with excavation/construction work.
3. Hart & Sons LLC stated that they have not failed to complete any work awarded to them or defaulted on a contract.
4. Recently completed projects were for Bingham Family Farms (\$50,000) and NGM Grain Company (\$60,000) for the excavation work associated with a grain system and roadway construction.
5. Hart & Sons LLC's related watermain work experience is site infrastructure work, including water and sanitary sewer main construction for residential developments in Sycamore, Dixon and Rockford, IL. It doesn't appear that Hart & Sons LLC has performed any municipal watermain projects similar in scope to the Kelley Drive watermain replacement project.

6. We checked a few of the references Hart & Sons LLC provided, and the following are the comments from the references.

John Laskowski, City of Sycamore Engineering Dept.

Hart & Sons LLC performed 900 feet of ditch grading to a detention pond. The quality of the work performed was good.

John Graddy, City of Sycamore Engineering Dept.

Hart & Sons LLC constructed approximately 1,300 feet of watermain and sanitary sewer for a townhome residential development 3 to 4 years ago. This work may have been done under Hart Excavating, Inc., which was owned by just Mr. Tom Hart at the time. Mr. Graddy said they were good to work with and the quality of the work was fine. but they were a little "green" and inexperienced at the time they did that project.

Nick Panseca, Developer of Residential Projects in Sycamore, Rockford and Dixon

Mr. Tom Hart has done all the streets, curbs, water and sewer installation for four (4) different residential developments in Sycamore, Rockford and Dixon. Mr. Hart also performed the excavation for the foundation and installed the water and sewer services to the homes/townhomes. Mr. Panseca said the quality of the work was good and Mr. Hart was good to work with.

Evan Buskohl, William Charles Waste Companies

Hart & Sons LLC has been working on the excavation of a sedimentation pond at the Rochelle Landfill site. Mr. Buskohl stated that Hart & Sons LLC is a smaller company and their typical work force on their project included Tom Hart, Matt Hart and one other laborer. Mr. Buskohl stated that they have been good to work with and the quality of work has been good.

Rusty Cox, Dixon Water Superintendent

Hart & Sons LLC installed the water services to the townhome development along the Rock River. Mr. Cox indicated that Hart & Sons LLC got off on the wrong foot by using City fire hydrants without permission. Mr. Cox said the water services were installed before the site grading was performed, which required a significant amount of fill. The water services ended up 12 feet deep, and Hart & Sons had to come back and raise the water services so the City could get their valve key on the shut-off valve. Mr. Cox indicated that they did not appear to be real experienced.

Ken Bunge, Engineer with CES

Hart & Sons LLC listed on their references that they did work in the Village of Creston for the construction of their sanitary sewer system. We are waiting for a call back from Mr. Bunge, who was the engineer for that project, to see how they performed.

## PROJECT AWARD

Hart & Sons LLC was the low bidder at \$148,118.69. Hart & Sons LLC had the following bidding irregularities:

- Bid Bond form was not signed and attested.
- Statement of Bidder's Qualifications form was not dated and the Notary Public didn't complete all the information.

- There was a mathematical error on their Proposal for the Curb and Gutter Replacement bid item that increased their bid amount by \$0.40.

Hart & Sons LLC's work experience appears to be mostly excavation and earthwork. They have had a small amount of work experience with watermain and sanitary sewer installation for new residential developments. They don't appear to have any municipal watermain construction experience where the construction has taken place in existing developed area where they would be working adjacent to other existing utilities. John Graddy, City of Sycamore Engineering Dept, stated Hart & Sons LLC was good to work with but were "green" and inexperienced at the time they did the watermain and sanitary sewer construction for a residential development in Sycamore 3 to 4 years ago. All of the other references checked generally stated Hart & Sons LLC was good to work with and the quality of the work was good, however, the projects were not similar to the Kelley Drive Watermain Replacement project.

Go Excavating, Inc. was the second low bidder at 164,235.00 which was \$16,116.31 above Hart & Sons LLC. Go Excavating, Inc. had no bidding irregularities with their bid. Go Excavating, Inc. has performed both municipal and private watermain and sanitary sewer projects. We have worked with Go Excavating on municipal water and sanitary sewer projects in Rochelle, Savanna and Dixon and they have performed well on those projects. The Rochelle project was the S. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street and Ave H sanitary sewer replacement and the First Avenue sanitary manhole installation project which was a \$206,336.00 project that was completed in 2009.

The "Instructions to Bidders – Award of Contract: Rejection of Bids" section in the bidding documents states the following:

"The contract will be awarded to the low, responsive, responsible Bidder complying with the conditions of the Invitation for Bids. The Bidder to whom the award is made will be notified at the earliest possible date. The Local Public Agency, however, reserves the right to reject any and all Bids and to waive any informality in Bids received whenever such rejection or waiver is in its interest.

"The Local Public Agency reserves the right to consider as unqualified to do the work of the general construction, any Bidder who does not habitually perform with his own forces the major portions of the work involved in the construction of the Improvements embraced in this Contract."

Please feel free to call if you have any questions, or we are willing to meet with you at your convenience to discuss the bid award in more detail.

Sincerely,

WILLETT, HOFMANN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

BY 

Matt Hansen, P.E.

MH:rv

Encl.

cc: Ed Carr, RMU General Manager w/ encl.  
Joanne Peters, RMU Administrative Assistant w/ encl.  
File